

## **Gender Stereotype News in Context of the Ethnicity: Scale Development and Validation**

**Syed Hassan Raza**

Bahauddin Zakariya University

**Lubna Zaheer**

University of the Punjab

and

**Moneeba Iftikhar**

Lahore College for Women University

The ongoing development of gender stereotype news research calls for developing an instrument to tap into the ethnicity context. This study analyzes the gender stereotype news in the context of the ethnicity to develop and validate the scale. The deductive method of item generation has been employed in the study. In total three studies were conducted. The first study is based on the 12 experts' ratings of the items for the content and constructs validity. A survey of ( $N = 227$ ) was conducted in January to February 2017 for the second study for the scale construction and inter-item consistency, reliability and factor analysis were analyzed. For the third study, a survey of ( $N = 222$ ) was conducted for the scale validation and convergent and criterion-related validity were analyzed. Based on the findings of experts all 14 items were retained, however, one item was deleted in the result of the factor analysis. To analyze convergent validity, we used the accurate depiction of facts (AF) as a predictor of gender stereotype news. While the one possible outcome of media believability (MB), was used to measure criterion-related validity. The findings suggest proposing the final 13-item scale of the gender stereotype news in the context of ethnicity (GSN).

*Keywords.* Gender stereotype news scale, scale development, content and construct validity, convergent validity

---

Lubna Zaheer and Moneeba Iftikhar, Department of Mass Communication, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, Pakistan.

Syed Hassan Raza, Department of Communication Studies, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan and PhD in Communication from Universiti Utara, Malaysia.

Lubna Zaheer, Institute of Communication Studies, University of Punjab, Lahore.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Moneeba Iftikhar, Department of Mass Communication, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, Pakistan. Email: [mobi\\_80@yahoo.com](mailto:mobi_80@yahoo.com)

Media have been shown to have the potential to endorse or to call into query stereotypical views of social groups (Schmader, Block, & Lickel, 2015), including those defined by race (Scharrer & Ramasubramanian, 2015), ethnicity (Mastro, 2015), gender (Salter, 2018), and social identity (Hoyt & Murphy, 2016). To this point, research has identified that the mass media underpin stereotypes about different social groups including women (Robinson, Seib, & Frohlich, 2016). Ample research has also analyzed the effects of media stereotyping on attitudes toward social groups (Kluegel & Smith, 2017), public policies (Saleem, Prot, Anderson, & Lemieux, 2017), and implicit attitudes (Matthes & Schmuck, 2017).

Studies have explored the news media's ability to activate ethnic (Sui & Paul, 2017), racial (Ramasubramanian & Martinez, 2017) attitudes via stereotypic depictions of subgroups in news coverage. Those exposed to ethnically stereotypic news primes racial/ethnic attitudes which are subsequently used for evaluations of given ethnic group (Sui & Paul, 2017). However, few studies (e.g., Vezich, Gunter, & Lieberman, 2017) have examined how these social groups react to media stereotyping of their own group. In this standard, an important question that is how media consumers react the media's treatment to under representation or depiction of a social group such as women from their own ethnic group.

Undoubtedly, the ethnic perspective of the individuals is pivotal evaluating factor employed by the individuals upon receiving the news story (Beaudoin, 2011; Valentino, Brader, & Jardina, 2013). Past studies consider it as the moderating factor, for instance, Waheed, Schuck, Neijens, and De Vreese (2015) explains that how media consumers evaluate the statement made in the news about the women status in an ethnic group. Albeit, the relevancy of the ethnicity and the stereotype news is established but, slight efforts to indulge the gender stereotype news in the context of the ethnicity made in literature with the purpose of scale development.

In the context of Pakistan wherein emergence of free media is in an initial phase, reporting styles and policies of the media groups towards depicting women is also premature (Pintak & Nazir, 2013). Despite its positive role, it is facing criticism of misrepresentation of the facts and depicting certain groups negatively like women (Hassan, 2014). For example, many public spheres e.g. including local leadership are very vocal about the role of the news disseminated by the media on issues related to the women. In fact, public evaluate the sensitive issues reported in media to gauge the news stories in their own cultural context (Scharrer & Ramasubramanian, 2015). Plausibly, this ongoing debate also inspired media researchers to measure the

stereotyping in news with certain perspectives for instance gender, ethnicity, and etc (Ortiz & Behm-Morawitz, 2015). However, little advancement has been seen in the scale development and validation of the prevailing scales to measure gender stereotype news with such perspective.

Empirical evidence to ensures the construct level validity of the ethnicity in the context of the gender stereotype news. Moreover, there is another research gap in the scale development in terms of relating these two constructs; gender stereotype news and ethnicity together (Saleem et al., 2017). Ergo, the current work adopts the deductive approach which is in line with recommendations of the scale development by Hinkin, (1995) and Yamaguchi (2017). This is to provide a diverse scale of (GSN), in the context of Pakistan can perhaps advance the literature.

In doing so, this scale of the gender stereotype news in the ethnic context can advance the understanding about many psychological and communication phenomena such as news organization's credibility, the competence of social group and social identity (see Kim, Seo, & David, 2015). Despite these factors explained in news media investigations but remain unaddressed to conceptualize in context of media consumers reactions to the gender stereotyping of their own group. The study considers the most recent instruments and conceptualizations available on the ethnicity and gender stereotype news for the item adoption. To this end, the study is an attempt to develop the scale by adopting the deductive approach which remains indistinct in Pakistani settings of the ethnicity. The present study contributes theoretically by examining and refining the existing conceptual frames for the gender stereotype news. Meanwhile, practically it contributes by providing the new scale for measuring the gender stereotype news with a special emphasis on the ethnicity in the context of Pakistan which was not validated before in said context.

Media researchers have used several theoretical perspectives while explaining the news stereotypic portrayals priming (Arendt, 2013), in group favoritism (Appiah, Knobloch-Westerwick, & Alter, 2013), and social identity (Schmader et al., 2015). Some studies have linked the identity of outgroups and stereotyping in news effects (Tolsma, Stark, & Veenstra, 2013). These studies have found that people largely come to describe others in terms of centrally imperious traits and characteristics learned from, news media outlets such as news (Ramasubramanian & Martinez, 2017), or advertisements (Bharadwaj & Mehta, 2017). A key insight of stereotypic news coverage is provided by using priming theory perspective by the researchers. These studies have pointed out that stereotypic news

coverage of social groups, ethnic groups (Tolsma et al., 2013), or gender (Lee & Kim, 2016), subsequently activates the priming effect of the outgroup members towards the social groups in question. In turn, this unconscious racial (Dukes & Gaither, 2017), or gender (Lee & Kim, 2016) stereotype priming leads to the evaluation of group in question.

Past research using the model of information processing underlying the priming effect such as cognitive accessibility theory has identified that instead of accounting every retention related to a specific conclusion, individual use shortcut to streamline the process (Valentino et al., 2013). The primed attitudes are critical during decision making, especially when thorough information related to the choice is infrequent (Lee & Kim, 2016). Additionally, readily available information is weighted more heavily in the procedure. Conversely, recent studies (see Ramasubramanian & Martinez, 2017; Robinson et al., 2016) have specified that news stereotypic portrayals determine very same accessibility to the stereotyped social group as well. For example, Arendt, (2013) demonstrate that activated traits are also likely to be used in subsequent evaluations of uncertain behaviors towards the news organization as well.

Dukes and Gaither (2017) noted that in case of incongruence the credibility of the news media can be at stake in turn. Further, media message believability is another factor which can be affected by news coverage which diverges from the cultural or ideological facts related to that group (Oyedeki, 2010). Another notion that identified stereotypes about one's group (i.e., stigma) in media contents, devalue specific aspect of one's identity and turn as social identity threat for the stigmatized individual (Arendt, 2017).

Indeed, such stereotypic portrayals can be reflected in experiences of discrimination such as women not being given the same opportunities as men in these fields (Hassan, 2014) or be made salient in a social context such as viewing television advertisements that portray women in domestic roles (Bharadwaj & Mehta, 2017). Both contexts are likely to activate social identity threats in women (Luong, & Knobloch-Westerwick, 2017; e.g., Schmader et al., 2015). Importantly, research has revealed that modest awareness about the cultural or ethnic (Tran, Khanh-Ngoc, Quang, & Trong, 2017) and racial (Dukes & Gaither, 2017) stereotype held against one's group is abundant to threaten one's social identity. Social identity threat can, in turn, influence a variety of individual and group-based reactions in stigmatized individuals (Arendt, 2017).

Despite these interesting findings that awareness about the stereotypes can lead towards social identity threats (Arendt, 2017), news media credibility (Dukes & Gaither, 2017), and image of a news organization (Oyedeji, 2010). The literature lacks a construct to tap such effects in the context of news media ethnic stereotypic coverage on women (Schmader et al., 2015). In the following, we have focused on three strategies, first, we have conceptualized, developed and validated the gender stereotype news (GNE) to measure how people react in case of stereotypic portrayals of their own group member (women). Second, we have determined the influence of accurate depiction of facts (AF) variable on the presented gender stereotype news (GNE). This is to provide the evidence that whether the accurate depiction of facts (AF) positively or negatively affects the gender stereotype news evaluation which theoretically we postulate as a positive factor. Third, we have evaluated the consequence of the gender stereotype news in terms of media believability which have theoretical origins with models such as CBM.

The ethnic groups are closely bound together specifically; the shared attribute is related to the perception of the individuals about the competence of ethnic groups (Kohring & Matthes, 2007). The individuals have also the tendency of the gender stereotype that the group they belong is more warmth and competent and individuals consideration of competency of their own group generate their perception to evaluate the information about their own group meanwhile about the other groups as well.

Therefore, it assists as a two-way approach on one side individuals have a possible expectation about the portrayal of their own group, on the other hand, they have also expectations about the portrayal of other groups (Turcotte, York, Irving, Scholl, & Pingree, 2015). Previous scales to date on the gender stereotype news consider this approach but lack explanation that how it is related to the other factor like the credibility of the media, social identity and ethnicity in perspective of a specific nation. Thus, we consider this factor combined with other aspects discussed in the literature to propose a comprehensive concept of the gender stereotype news in the context of the ethnicity.

Evidence from studies also indicates that individuals adhere beliefs about the other and supposed to be verifiable inappropriate beliefs. Lee and Chyi (2014), offer evidence that the individuals admit inappropriate claims based on their motivation to hold existing perception misinformation about the others. As new information about them or others ethnic groups comes in, they filter through their existing beliefs (Beaudoin, 2011).

In line with the notion of cognition, individuals are more probable to attain the perception of the information that approves prevailing schemes and more probable to discard inconsistent information (Turcotte et al., 2015). Each ethnic group has dissimilar in terms of their beliefs about the certain ideas, therefore they rely on the degree to which the new information corresponds with their existing ideas (Appiah et al., 2013).

Alternatively, this similar motivation path might be stimulated by anti-ethnic opinions. Persons who have pre-existing dislike about the certain ethnic group may more probable to discard the positive information about that group (Tran et al., 2017). Attitudes toward other ethnic groups and the idea of the competency of their own group could stimulate the gender stereotype towards the received information based on the negative pre-existing views learned from their ethnic or racial context (see also Igartua, Moral-toranzo, & Fernández, 2012; Lee & Kim, 2016). Therefore, the current study re-conceptualizes the gender stereotype news in context ethnicity based on the combination of the gender stereotype factors discussed in the literature and uses the deductive approach to apprehend this phenomenon in context Pakistan.

Most of the research on the Pakistani media is based on the content analysis does not provide empirical evidence that how people respond to above mentioned stereotypic portrayal (see Tehreem & Raza, 2017). This study has adopted the deductive method which is to offer measurement equivalence and validation to the standing scales by adding the ethnic context of Pakistan. The inclusion of the ethnic context firstly justifies theoretically as drawing studies to understand the media consumption pattern supports social contexts such as ethnicity. Research (i.e., Fernández-Ferrín, Bande-Vilela, Klein, & del Río-Araújo, 2015) has established that the conception of ethnocentrism has a twofold inference. One, the groups are logically antagonistic among themselves and second, produces a sequence of feelings of devotion among associates of their own group (Tran et al., 2017). In this way, ethnicity related to provincialism and cultural thinness as a leaning to admit those that are culturally alike and reject those that are not. To illustrate, when women are depicted in news media is admittedly evaluated through ethnic evaluation in case of incongruence feeling of stereotypic depiction may emerge which may have different consequences for the source of news.

Secondly, past studies highlighted only issues with the subjective approach (i.e. content analysis), instead empirically measuring the actual receipt of media contents. Lastly, media progression in Pakistan has brought in a stream of news media channels which also include

local news channels. This has triggered a race for the competitive advantage, the content of Pakistani media groups to date has not been measured in the context of the reactions of the gender stereotype news. In another word, how people react the routine news content disseminated by the Pakistani media when one's group is represented in news story. This is to understand whether the consumer pattern of Pakistan as well as the perception of the news credibility or believability which is crucial for a media channel to maintain its brand equity (Oyededeji, 2010).

## Method

### Objectives

1. To develop the gender stereotype news scale for adults.
2. To establish the construct validity through confirmatory factor analysis.
3. To establish the convergent validity of scale.

### Development of Gender Stereotype News Scale

**Phase-I: Item Generations.** To develop a scale of the gender stereotype news by giving the context to the ethnicity, the study considered all the dimensions of the ethnic-based evaluation of the news. The items generation for such a comprehensive measure it was required to consider all the possible factors which may affect the extent of the gender stereotype feeling among the people. The study considered all the most recent available scales on the ethnic-based evaluation of the media. Present research on gender stereotype news (e.g. Tolsma et al., 2013), has revealed that any sort of the negative or misinterpret information in the reporting an event related to the ethnic group is crucial to maintaining the trust of the audience. Such choices of the facts or perceived misinterpretation can simply distort the image of the media organization. Another perspective of news credibility is also discussed in the study of (Kim et al., 2015), information about the ethnic group may result in a different outcome and produce the effect the news credibility. The individuals also consider the competency of their own group to generate the perception to evaluate the information about their own group meanwhile about the other groups as well.

Therefore, the study operationalizes gender stereotype news is determined by an individual by evaluating it in the context of the individual's ethnic attributes like belief, ethnic identity and group competence learned from the ethnic group from which an individual belongs. The context of ethnicity is used to tap into all possible

dimensions, and we assume that the ethnicity has the central role in determining the gender stereotype news as it provides the capability to the individuals to identify and evaluate the facts and information delivered to them in their own ethnic perspective.

**Phase-II: Content and Construct Validity.** The aim of the Study one comprised of two stages. In the first stage, the operationalization of the construct was conducted by using the deductive method of generating the scale items as mention above. The study selected a deductive method for generating the items the reason that the selected constructs have a theoretical foundation as discussed earlier. It allows adequate direction for item generation. The deductive approach is used for assurance of the content and constructs validity for this purpose. Stage 2 was conducted to content validity assessment of the scale. The procedure is based on the recommendations of the (Hinkin, 1995, 1998; Yamaguchi, 2017) of scale development procedure. The aim was to assess the adequacy of our construct of gender stereotype news and ethnicity.

The generated 14 items along with the operational were sent to the twelve experts and requested to rate these items. Among these six were academicians of journalism in the universities and six were working journalist. Among six working journalists, we selected three from the news desk of the leading newspaper and television and three experienced field reporters. GSN was designed to analyze the negative feeling among the people based on their ethnocentric evaluation. Raters were requested to score each of the items on a 4-point scale with no neutral value based on its relevancy and precision with the operational definition in the context of Pakistan.

The adopted criteria of the content assessment are based on the guidelines of the Lawshe (1975). Alongside comments were requested to rephrase or to improve the generated items. The responses of the raters (scores) on the generated items were analyzed by using the content validity ratio (CVR) formula proposed by (Lawshe, 1975). The CVR (content validity rating) is one of the most common and accepted methods in scale development research (Raza, Bakar, & Mohamad, 2018; Usry, Partington, & Partington, 2018). The CVR formula is dependent on the number of raters, who rate (score) the item on 1 to 4 scales based on its content relevancy and adequacy with the operational definition and context. The formula explains when the less than half of the experts rate the item as suitable or relevant for the evaluation of the gender stereotype feelings the CVR is negative. Whereas, if half of the expert's rate at as the suitable and half rate it as negative in that case CVR is 0. Whereas, if more than half of the expert's rate the item as the suitable, the CVR is positive. In the case



of total agreement between the expert's ratings about any item, the CVR is 1. For 12 experts, the required value of CVR to establish the content validity is .56 which allows retaining an item (Lawshe, 1975). In present study, all the 14 items generated maintained the required minimum value of .66 or above and were reserved. However, based on the comments of the experts two items (item 9 and 5), were rephrased.

### **Phase-III: Establishing the Psychometric properties of scale.**

**Sample.** The survey was conducted for the study. Participants ( $N = 227$ ) were selected from the undergraduate and postgraduate students enrolled in communication and sociology department of the University of Punjab, Pakistan. The selection of the students from these two departments of this university justifies the purpose of the study based on two reasons: (a) University of the Punjab is the largest public sector university in Pakistan and students of this university almost represents the all ethnic groups in Pakistan and (b), the selected departments are closely related to the basic themes of study ethnicity and gender stereotype news.

**Procedure.** Students were invited to participate in the survey and ethical commitment was made that their personal contact information would be kept confidential as per the university rules. The students who agreed to participate were asked to fill online survey form to submit their response by using the lab facility located in the university.

After receiving the responses normality of the data was observed by employing the skewness/kurtosis test and visual inspection for the outliers. After deleting the outlier's cases the data of 222 individuals, meet the criteria of normality, were retained for further analysis. There were 119 (53.6%) males and 103 (46.4%) females in the sample. In terms of the ethnic group's representation results matched considerably 123 (55.4%) Punjabi, 34 (15.3%) Sindhi, 39 (17.6%) KPK, and 20 (9.0%) Balochistan and 6 (2.7 %) with other ethnic backgrounds with Pakistan's national population data. Therefore, the student sample mirrored the ethnic composition of Pakistan to the reasonable extent.

## **Results**

### **Reliability**

The findings of the item-total correlation between the 14 generated items, exhibited statistically significant. The 14 items proved statistically significant, acceptable correlation as recommended

to retain, equal to .5 or above by Gwet (2014). Internal consistency reliability of all 14 items was also evaluated by using Cronbach's alpha (Hinkin, 1995; Hinkin, 1998). Cronbach's alpha for the generated 14 item scale was .80, Standardized alpha = .80, representing that the scale satisfactorily captures the construct domain (Hinkin, 1998).

**Exploratory Factor Analysis.** The study used the principal axis factor (PAF) analysis with oblique rotation. It is recommended to use in the scale development procedure, selection ensures to identify the structure of the scale, instead of using likelihood or component analysis (Hair, Anderson, Babin, & Black, 2010; Hinkin, 1998). While the oblique rotation technique is used to purify the correlation amongst the factors more accurately and considered as the more effective in the case of scale development.

The selection of the extraction and rotation for this study is based on the recommendations of Hair et al., (2010) to attain meaningful factors. The criteria for the taking decision about the scale's factor solution involved: (a) the eigen values of 1.0 or above for all the extracted factors, (b) variance exceeds 60%, and (c) the loading of .70 or above with at least three items alongside the secondary loadings less than .40.

Based on the criteria mentioned earlier the findings in Table 1 indicate, two factors were extracted, explaining 61.22% variance and 17.36% respectively. The second factor had only one item: Item 7, with loading the only high loading of the .567 and low loading of the .301. Therefore, the 13 items were retained with a one-factor solution for further study and item 7 was deleted.

Table 1  
*Exploratory Factor Analysis (EFA) for Gender Stereotype News Scale (N = 211)*

Sr. No	Items	1	2
1	Media never depict wrongfully competency of the women from my ethnic group.	.78	.25
2	Media never depict wrongfully intelligence of the women from my ethnic group.	.71	.14
3	Media never depict wrongfully skillfulness of the women from my ethnic group.	.77	.17
4	Media never depict wrongfully capabilities of women from my ethnic group.	.87	.19
5	Based on the story you saw about women from your ethnic group; how likely would you be to seek out local news from this media outlet in the future?	.87	.27

*Continued...*

Sr. No	Items	1	2
6	If you saw another story about women from your ethnic group from this same news outlet, how likely would you be to read it?	.80	.15
7	Do you feel proud to be part of the ethnic group you belong, based on the status of women in your group?	.30	.57
8	In general, I prefer doing things with people from my own culture than with people from different cultures.	.88	.18
9	Most other cultures are backward in terms of women's respect compared to my culture.	.75	.24
10	I respect the values and customs about the status of the women in other cultures.	.87	.27
11	I view the news channel which truly depicts women of my ethnic group.	.90	.37
12	I view the news channel which depicts a friendly image of my ethnic group in terms of respecting women.	.79	.15
13	I view the news channel which honestly depicts status of women in my ethnic group.	.72	.28
14	I mostly view the news channel which depicts role of the women in an acceptable manner.	.79	.24
Eigen value		4.36	1.58
% of Variance		61.22	12.36
Cumulative %		61.22	73.58

*Note.* EM: Principal Axis Factoring. RM: Oblimin with Kaiser Normalization.

**Phase-IV: Scale Validation.** In the result of the experts rating and purifying the structure of the scale, we retained 14 items for the proposed GSN scale with an acceptable reliability. In line with the scale validation procedure which suggests construct and convergent, discriminant and criterion-related validity by using the different sample (Hinkin 1998; Yamaguchi, 2017).

**Sample.** The sample size for this phase was 222; there were 134 (60.4%) males and 88 (39.6%) females in the sample. In terms of the ethnic group's representation results somewhat harmonized (142 (63.9%) Punjabi, 21 (9.5%) Sindhi, 35 (15.8%) KPK, and 11 (4.9%) Balochistan and 13 (5.9%) with other ethnic backgrounds from Pakistan.

Similarly, following the directions of the Kline (2011) and Hair et al. (2010), a separate data has been collected for the ensuring the validities of the scale. Kline (2011) noted that conducting EFA and CFA with same data is incorrect method and practice. Drawing on this evaluating the convergent, discriminant and criterion validity, we selected one antecedent accurate depiction of the facts and one possible outcome of the gender stereotype news evaluation in the context of ethnicity media believability. The selection of these two

factors is based on the conceptual relevance of the measure of the gender stereotype news evaluation in the context of ethnicity GSN scale.

The study used antecedent to measure the convergent validity of our GSN scale in this study, based on the guidelines in the prior studies (Yamaguchi, 2017). One possible outcome was used to evaluate the criterion-related validity of GSN scale. The selection of the accurate depiction of the facts and media believability is in line with the priming theory (Tolsma et al., 2013). The accurate depiction of any group is evaluated by the individual based on his extent to which an individual depends on the ethnic-centered information (Kohring & Matthes, 2007). Therefore, the accurate depiction is closely related to the gender stereotype news evaluation in the context of ethnicity. Whereas, the outcome of the media believability as we proposed based on the priming theory, the gender stereotype news evaluation in the context of ethnicity GSN may affect the individual's believability in the media in case of the negative evaluation.

## **Instruments**

**Accurate Depiction of the Facts.** The accurate depiction of the facts (AF) has been chosen as the antecedent (independent variable) of the gender stereotype news evaluation in the context of ethnicity GSN. We have measured the accurate depiction of the fact's variable with 4 items on 7 point Likert scale adopted from the work of Kohring and Matthes, (2007). Accurate depiction of the facts (AF) variable has revealed reliability with Cronbach alpha  $\alpha = .86$ .

**Media Believability.** The media believability has been chosen as the antecedent (dependent variable) of the gender stereotype news evaluation in the context of ethnicity GSN. Media Believability (MB) variable has been measured with 5 items on 7 point Likert scale adopted from the work of the Turcotte et al. (2015). MB variable has revealed reliability with Cronbach alpha  $\alpha = .81$ .

## **Results**

After deleting the outlier's cases the data of  $N = 211$ , meet the criteria of normality, were retained for further analysis and a correlation matrix is reported in Table 2. The correlation analysis revealed that there is no potential have been found for a second-order factor structure. The bivariate analysis has provided the evidence of the association of the three variables. But, the correlation matrix

triangle among the three elements is not flat, so it has confirmed that respondents have distinguished the items (Kline, 2011).

Table 2

*Correlation Between Gender Stereotype News, Accurate Depiction of Facts, and Media Believability (N = 211)*

	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	GSN	MB
GSN	4.47	.72	-	
AD	4.44	1.04	.24*	-
MB	4.29	.96	.40*	.44*

\* $p < .01$ .

### Confirmatory Factor Analysis

With the purpose of the validation of the unidimensional factor structure of GSN, a CFA was conducted, all thirteen items were loaded on a single factor. The result clarified a better fit model with data of 222. Initial, results suggested,  $\chi^2(37) = 146.11$ ,  $p < .00$ , GFI = .98, AGFI, =.94, NFI = .93, TLI, =.87, IFI = .95, CFI = .94, RMSEA = .05 and SRMR = .03. After adjusting the recommended covariance amongst error terms, the further best fit model was attained as,  $\chi^2(25) = 30.58$ ,  $p < .231$ , GFI = .99, AGFI, =.98, NFI = .98, TLI, =.99, IFI = .97, CFI = .99, RMSEA = .02 and SRMR = .02. As the results indicated that after the adjustments,  $p < .23$  and not significant and this is desired in scale development. The attained values indicated an acceptable fitness of the proposed one factor thirteen item model.

Table 3

*Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) with Items Loadings for Gender Stereotype News Scale (N = 211)*

Items	Loadings	Items	Loadings
GSN1	.74	GSN7	.81
GSN2	.72	GSN8	.73
GSN3	.80	GSN9	.82
GSN4	.89	GSN10	.92
GSN5	.82	GSN11	.76
GSN6	.74	GSN12	.70
		GSN13	.71
Composite Reliability (C.R)			.95
Average Variance Extracted (AVE)			.61

### Criterion-Related Validity

For the criterion-related validation of the model in terms of its extent to predict the certain outcomes, we selected one possible outcome of media believability contingent with the suggestions of the (Hinkin, 1998). For testing predictability of (GSN) outcome construct (MB), three models were tested one without the control variable and with one control variable of gender, and finally the third one with two control variables of gender and ethnic backgrounds and compared.

At the first stage, path analysis was conducted to observe the proposed GSN as the predictor of the media believability (MB) without any control variable and results suggested good fitness as,  $\chi^2(96) = 282.14, 2.94, p < .00$ , GFI = .97, AGFI = .95, NFI = .93, TLI, = .92, IFI = .95, CFI = .95, RMSEA = .04 and SRMR = .03; and accounted acceptable extent of variance change ( $\beta = .30, \Delta R^2 = .17, p < .00$ ). In the Model two with one control variable of gender (GSN) remains significant predictor of (MB) as, ( $\beta = .24, \Delta R^2 = .19, p < .01$ ) and model fitness also remained as a good fit as  $\chi^2(94) = 261.03, p < .00$ , GFI = .97, AGFI = .95, NFI = .93, TLI = .93, IFI = .96, CFI = .96, RMSEA = .04 and SRMR = .04. In the third Model with two control variables of gender and ethnicity (GSN) remains significant predictor of (MB) as, ( $\beta = .18, \Delta R^2 = .24, p < .00$ ) and model fitness also revealed good fit as  $\chi^2(126) = 294.87, p < .00$ , GFI = .96, AGFI = .95, NFI = .95, TLI = .97, IFI = .95, CFI = .97, RMSEA = .03 and SRMR = .04.

### Discussion

Based on the expert's ratings 14 items GSN construct was retained. This Study was conducted to analyze the reliability and purification of the scale structure. The reliability analysis and inter-item total correlational was analyzed for the internal consistency in the first step. The results indicated that all items showed high reliability. In the second step, we conducted EFA and one structured factor was attained, however, item seven had low loading and deleted, we preceded further with 13 items GSN scale for the next study.

Researchers have started to discover the affective responses when social groups are confronted with stereotypical media depictions of their group (Ortiz & Behm-Morawitz, 2015; Schmader & Block, 2015). While these studies are developing the understanding of how media influence social groups, the literature does not directly evaluate how media influence these groups' self-identification as members of the social group. Further, in the absence of the comprehensive measurement instruments has positioned a substantial constraint to

present the gender stereotype news process in the context of the ethnicity and its connection with other ethnicity constructs.

Similarly, several theoretical perspectives in addressing stereotypes effects, ethnic and ideological congruences importance including the associative stereotype threats (Appel & Kronberger, 2012), the credible brand model (Oyedeji, 2010), priming effects (Tolsma et al., 2013), and the social identity theory (Schmader et al., 2015). Most of the mentioned studies have focused on different questions such as stereotype activation in defining relationships with outgroups (Tolsma et al., 2013). The interplay of the stereotypic depiction of news media specific to the given information or image of the one's group and evaluation remains largely limited to the identification of this factors possibly involved (Ramasubramanian & Martinez, 2017).

Among these factors' activation of ethnic perspectives interpretations for developed attitude in responding the stereotypic depiction in news related to the minorities (Dukes & Gaither, 2017), gender (Salter, 2018), and religion (Saleem et al., 2017) have been evaluated recently. These studies include one similar pattern of news consumption that is a contradiction of provided image or information with the culturally developed image has been evaluated as the misinterpretation. This study has found the presented scale consistent with these studies and results also identified the strength ethnic perspective. To exemplify, the validated scale associates the gender stereotype and ethnic perspective interplay and argued that this propositional evaluation will provide information that how ecological input may affect the consequences such as media believability (MB).

Drawing on past research suggestions that, to navigate inputs from a social setting, the study has made use of gender stereotyping and group-based evaluation of the stimuli such as the accuratedepiction of the facts (AF) about the group depicted as antecedent. The result has suggested that accurate depicted facts in the news story were evaluated positively. This is consistent with the past studies that, group-based (ethnic) feeling of stereotypes can be activated quite routinely in the existence of group-relevant stimuli (Arendt, 2017). For instance, news portraying stereotype information about the role of women, the person belongs to the same ethnic group will negatively evaluate the news and found it a stereotypic depiction of the women. In Pakistani media, information has been disseminated about the access to the professional jobs etc. to the women. The outgroup members may evaluate this news positively while the personal feelings are evoked involuntarily belongs to the same ethnic group. This can evoke group competence feelings and source (media)

image in turn, devalued. In other words, when individuals are exposed to a stereotypic news related to their own group, they may tend to adopt a negative attitude.

As deliberated earlier, group competence, ethnicity, and news credibility constructs, although being presented recently and used in some studies, to tap into the ethnic dimension to activate the gender stereotype effects of the news media. These measures lack inclusiveness in terms of measuring all possible dimensions of the gender stereotype news and context related issues. For example, the social competence measure, although having psychometric characteristics, was deliberated to operationalize the dimension of warmth and competence to analyze the gender stereotype in the context of attitude. Additionally, the ethnicity scale developed by the (e.g. Stark, Flache, & Veenstra, 2013), focused on the personal beliefs to evaluate the gender stereotype context of the individuals. Therefore, by combining these measurements to investigate gender stereotype news in context ethnicity can enrich the conceptual depth of the proposed measure.

We have adopted the guidelines of the Hinkin (1995) for the scale development procedure. The study was focused on testing the content validity of the generated items. The results of the study suggested retaining the items only two items were suggested to rephrase. Further, a study has tested and refined the scale by analyzing the inter-item consistency, reliability and factor analyses. Based on the results of the study the retained thirteen items scales was analyzed by using a larger sample to test convergent and criterion-related validities of the proposed scale. The consequences of this investigation verified adequate psychometric characteristics of the measurement scale. An ending version of the gender stereotype news in the context of ethnicity (GSN), measurement scale is offered in the appendix.

Overall, the study contributes to propose the gender stereotype news in the context of ethnicity (GSN), measurement scale to the scholars which is based on the theory to analyze the ethnic context of the gender stereotype news. For example, ethnocentrism notion characterizes a general tendency to understand individuals own group as the focal point to interpret social phenomena from a group context and to reject those ideas which are socially different, sightlessly accepting those which are socially similar (Fernández-Ferrín et al., 2015). Symbols and standards of individual's ethnical group are understood as substances of self-importance (Tran et al., 2017). In case of news content depicting the image or role of women activate the ethnic evaluation which will determine to accept or react to the given depiction. Thus, for this instrument, we have operationalized



gender stereotype news regarding the ethnic attributes an individual held. It distinguishes itself from the other previous presented instruments, based on its comprehensive nature to tap into all possible dimensions of the ethnicity central role in determining the gender stereotype news.

As, previously, the scales focused on the single dimensions, therefore, lacked operationalization capabilities. Additionally, direct connection between ethnicity and gender stereotype news were not considered and possible outcomes were not directive in this context. This study has also identified media believability as the consequence of gender stereotype news. The results of the scale validation in the study have demonstrated that there is a significant relationship exists between gender stereotype news and media believability. The results evidently verified that gender stereotype news is a substantial predictor of media believability outcome. This has provided a theoretical foundation that studies can extend the models of consumer patterns and image of the media organizations such as credible brand news.

### **Implications**

Practically, the presented instrument can serve as a useful tool for the media organizations to gauge the current practices of reporting the events about the ethnic groups in the context of Pakistan. Additionally, based on the results media organization can deliberate the training to the newsroom executive and field reporters to understand the sensitivity of the ethnic context which may result in developing the gender stereotype among the media users.

### **Limitations and Directions for Future Research**

Despite the contributions as mentioned above, some limitations also exist in this study and can be considered for the future research. The study recognizes the gender stereotype as the process which may activate automatically; gender stereotype news as a construct only captures the context of the ethnicity to evaluate the received information. Albeit study has identified antecedent (accurate depiction of facts) and consequence (media believability), but this study has a limitation as it has used survey method for validation of the (GNE). Future studies may conduct experimental studies to validate the casual-relationships by using other theoretical foundations. We also

recommend that the same scale can be reworded in context of the advertisement research to interpret the ethnocentric consumer behavior.

## References

- Appel, M., & Kronberger, N. (2012). Stereotype threat and the achievement gap: Stereotype threat prior to test taking. *Educational Psychology Review, 24*, 609-635. doi:10.1007/s10648-012-9200-4
- Appiah, O., Knobloch-Westerwick, S., & Alter, S. (2013). Ingroup favoritism and outgroup derogation: Effects of news valence, character race, and recipient race on selective news reading. *Journal of Communication, 63*(3), 517-534.
- Arendt, F. (2013). Dose-dependent media priming effects of stereotypic newspaper articles on implicit and explicit stereotypes. *Journal of Communication, 63*, 830-851. doi:10.1111/jcom.12056
- Arendt, F. (2017). Impulsive facial-threat perceptions after exposure to stereotypic crime news. *Communication Research, 44*(6), 793-816.
- Beaudoin, C. E. (2011). News effects on bonding and bridging social capital: An empirical study relevant to ethnicity in the United States. *Communication Research, 38*(2), 155-178. doi:10.1177/0093650210381598
- Bharadwaj, A., & Mehta, R. (2017). Annihilating or perpetuating the gender stereotype? An analysis of Indian television advertisements. *Decision, 44*(3), 179-191.
- Dukes, K. N., & Gaither, S. E. (2017). Black racial stereotypes and victim blaming: Implications for media coverage and criminal proceedings in cases of police violence against racial and ethnic minorities. *Journal of Social Issues, 73*(4), 789-807.
- Fernández-Ferrín, P., Bande-Vilela, B., Klein, J. G., & del Río-Araújo, M. L. (2015). Consumer ethnocentrism and consumer animosity: Antecedents and consequences. *International Journal of Emerging Markets, 10*(1), 73-88.
- Gwet, K. L. (2014). *Handbook of inter-rater reliability: The definitive guide to measuring the extent of agreement among raters*. Gaithersburg, MD: Advanced Analytics, LLC.
- Hair, J. F., Anderson, R. E., Babin, B. J., & Black, W. C. (2010). *Multivariate data analysis: A global perspective* (Vol. 7). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson.
- Hassan, K. (2014). The role of private electronic media in radicalising Pakistan. *The Round Table, 103*(1), 65-81.
- Hinkin, T. R. (1995). A review of scale development practices in the study of organizations. *Journal of Management, 21*(5), 967-988. doi:10.1016/0149-2063(95)90050-0

- Hinkin, T. R. (1998). A brief tutorial on the development of measures for use in survey questionnaires. *Organizational Research Methods, 1*(1), 104-121.
- Hoyt, C. L., & Murphy, S. E. (2016). Managing to clear the air: Stereotype threat, women, and leadership. *The Leadership Quarterly, 27*(3), 387-399.
- Igartua, J. J., Moral-Toranzo, F., & Fernández, I. (2012). Cognitive, attitudinal, and emotional effects of news frame and group cues, on processing news about immigration. *Journal of Media Psychology, 23*(4), 174-185. doi:10.1027/1864-1105/a000050
- Kim, J. H., Seo, M., & David, P. (2015). Alleviating depression only to become problematic mobile phone users: Can face-to-face communication be the antidote? *Computers in Human Behavior, 51*, 440-447. doi:10.1016/j.chb.2015.05.030
- Kline, R. B. (2011). *Principles and practice of structural equation modeling*. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Kluegel, J. R., & Smith, E. R. (2017). *Beliefs about inequality: Americans' views of what is and what ought to be*. New York: Routledge.
- Kohring, M., & Matthes, J. (2007). Trust in news media: Development and validation of a multidimensional scale. *Communication Research, 34*(2), 231-252. doi:10.1177/0093650206298071
- Lawshe, C. H. (1975). A quantitative approach to content validity. *Personnel Psychology, 28*(4), 563-575. doi:10.1111/j.1744-6570.1975.tb01393.x
- Lee, A. M., & Chyi, H. I. (2014). Motivational consumption model exploring the psychological structure of news use. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 91*(4), 706-724. doi:10.1177/1077699014550088
- Lee, E. J., & Kim, Y. W. (2016). Effects of infographics on news elaboration, acquisition, and evaluation: Prior knowledge and issue involvement as moderators. *New Media & Society, 18*(8), 1579-1598. doi:10.1177/1461444814567982
- Luong, K. T., & Knobloch-Westerwick, S. (2017). Can the media help women be better at math? stereotype threat, selective exposure, media effects, and women's math performance. *Human Communication Research, 43*(2), 193-213.
- Mastro, D. (2015). Why the media's role in issues of race and ethnicity should be in the spotlight. *Journal of Social Issues, 71*(1), 1-16.
- Matthes, J., & Schmuck, D. (2017). The effects of anti-immigrant right-wing populist ads on implicit and explicit attitudes: A moderated mediation model. *Communication Research, 44*(4), 556-581.
- Ortiz, M., & Behm-Morawitz, E. (2015). Latinos' perceptions of intergroup relations in the United States: The cultivation of group-based attitudes and beliefs from English and Spanish language television. *Journal of Social Issues, 71*(1), 90-105.

- Oyedeji, T. A. (2010). The credible brand model: The effects of ideological congruency and customer-based brand equity on news credibility. *American Behavioral Scientist, 54*(2), 83-99.
- Pintak, L., & Nazir, S. J. (2013). Pakistani journalism: at the crossroads of Muslim identity, national priorities and journalistic culture. *Media, Culture & Society, 35*(5), 640-665. doi:10.1177/0163443713483654
- Ramasubramanian, S., & Martinez, A. R. (2017). News framing of Obama, racialized scrutiny, and symbolic racism. *Howard Journal of Communications, 28*(1), 36-54.
- Raza, S. H., Bakar, H. A., & Mohamad, B. (2018). Advertising appeals and Malaysian culture norms. *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication, 28*(1), 61-82. <https://doi.org/10.1075/japc.00004.raz>
- Robinson, P., Seib, P., & Frohlich, R. (2016). Gender, media and security, in *Routledge Handbook of Media, Conflict and Security Ed.* Piers Robinson, Philip Seib and Romy Fröhlich (pp. 22-35). Abingdon: Routledge.
- Saleem, M., Prot, S., Anderson, C. A., & Lemieux, A. F. (2017). Exposure to Muslims in media and support for public policies harming Muslims. *Communication Research, 44*(6), 841-869.
- Salter, E. (2018). A media discourse analysis of lone parents in the UK: Investigating the stereotype. In *lone parenthood in the life course* (pp. 55-74). Cham: Springer.
- Scharrer, E., & Ramasubramanian, S. (2015). Intervening in the media's influence on stereotypes of race and ethnicity: The role of media literacy education. *Journal of Social Issues, 71*(1), 171-185.
- Schmader, T., Block, K., & Lickel, B. (2015). Social identity threat in response to stereotypic film portrayals: Effects on self-conscious emotion and implicit ingroup attitudes. *Journal of Social Issues, 71*(1), 54-72.
- Sui, M., & Paul, N. (2017). Latino portrayals in local news media: Underrepresentation, negative stereotypes, and institutional predictors of coverage. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research, 46*(3), 273-294.
- Stark, T. H., Flache, A., & Veenstra, R. (2013). Generalization of positive and negative attitudes toward individuals to outgroup attitudes. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 39*(5), 608-622.
- Tehreem, F., & Raza, S. H. (2017). How do Pakistani print media covers crime stories on women: Comparative study of two newspapers. *VFAST Transactions on Education & Social Sciences, 13*(1), 1-15.
- Tolsma, J., van Deurzen, I., Stark, T. H., & Veenstra, R. (2013). Who is bullying whom in ethnically diverse primary schools? Exploring links between bullying, ethnicity, and ethnic diversity in Dutch primary schools. *Social Networks, 35*(1), 51-61. doi:10.1016/j.socnet.2012.12.002
- Tran, T. P., Khanh Ngoc Ho, B., Quang Le, T., & Trong Hoang, H. (2017). Application and validation of a consumer ethnocentrism scale in a young

- Vietnamese market segment. *Journal of Global Scholars of Marketing Science*, 27(1), 60-77.
- Turcotte, J., York, C., Irving, J., Scholl, R. M., & Pingree, R. J. (2015). News recommendations from social media opinion leaders: Effects on media trust and information seeking. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 20(5), 520-535.
- Usry, J., Partington, S. W., & Partington, J. W. (2018). Using Expert Panels to Examine the Content Validity and Inter-Rater Reliability of the ABLLS-R. *Journal of Developmental & Physical Disabilities*, 30(1), 27-38.
- Valentino, N. A., Brader, T., & Jardina, A. E. (2013). Immigration opposition among US whites: General ethnocentrism or media priming of attitudes about Latinos?. *Political Psychology*, 34(2), 149-166. doi:10.1111/j.1467-9221.2012.00928.x
- Vezich, I. S., Gunter, B. C., & Lieberman, M. D. (2017). Women's responses to stereotypical media portrayals: An fMRI study of sexualized and domestic images of women. *Journal of Consumer Behaviour*, 16(4), 322-331.
- Waheed, M., Schuck, A., Neijens, P., & De Vreese, C. (2015). The effects of news frames and political speech sources on political attitudes: The moderating role of values. *Communications*, 40(2), 147-169. doi.org/10.1515/commun-2015-0001
- Yamaguchi, I. (2017). Instruments for organizational communication assessment for Japanese care facilities. *Corporate Communications: An International Journal*, 22(4), 471-485.

## Appendix A: Gender stereotype News Scale in context of Ethnicity (GSN)

Instructions: Please answer to the following statements based on your experience about the news media coverage by using the following scale:

7 = *strongly agree*

6 = *moderately agree*

5 = *somewhat agree*

4 = *Neutral*

3 = *somewhat disagree*

2 = *moderately disagree*

1 = *strongly disagree*

1. Media never depict wrongfully competency of the women from my ethnic group.
2. Media never depict wrongfully intelligence of the women from my ethnic group.
3. Media never depict wrongfully skillfulness of the women from my ethnic group.
4. Media never depict wrongfully capabilities of women from my ethnic group.
5. Based on the story you saw about women from your ethnic group; how likely would you be to seek out local news from this media outlet in the future?
6. If you saw another story about women from your ethnic group from this same news outlet, how likely would you be to read it?
7. In general, I prefer doing things with people from my own culture than with people from different cultures.
8. Most other cultures are backward in terms of women's respect compared to my culture.
9. I respect the values and customs about the status of the women in other cultures.
10. I view the news channel which truly depicts women of my ethnic group.
11. I view the news channel which depicts a friendly image of my ethnic group in terms of respecting women.
12. I view the news channel which honestly depicts status of women in my ethnic group.
13. I mostly view the news channel which depicts role of the women in an acceptable manner.

Received 10<sup>th</sup> May, 2017

Revision received 12<sup>th</sup> April, 2018